

# Minutes of meeting of first Meta-Panel meeting

**Date: July 18, 2016**

Time: 9.30 - 16.30 (12:30 – 13:30 Lunch break)

Meeting place: LOFT hotel, Štefánikova 4, Bratislava

## **Participants, Meta-Panel**

Prof. Marja Makarow, Head of Meta-Panel

Prof. Sijbolt Noorda, Meta-Panel Member

Prof. John V. Wood, Meta-Panel Member

Prof. Pär Omling, Chair of Evaluation Panel for Section I

Prof. Toivo Maimets, Chair of Evaluation Panel for Section II

Prof. Milena Zic Fuchs, Chair of Evaluation Panel for Section III

## **Participants, SAS**

Prof. Pavol Šajgalík, President of SAS

Dr. Eva Majková, Vice-President (VP) for Research of SAS

Prof. Juraj Koppel, VP for Economy

Dr. Dušan Gálik, Scientific Secretary

Dr. Mária Omastová, Chair of Accreditation Committee (AC)

Dr. Karol Fröhlich, VP of Section I and AC member

Prof. Karol Marhold, VP of Section II and AC member

Prof. Emil Višňovský, VP of Section III and AC member

Prof. Daniela Ježová, Member of the Presidium of SAS - Section II.

Dr. Katarína Gmucová, Head of Assembly of SAS and AC member

Dr. Ľubica Lacinová, AC member

Dr. Zuzana Kusá, AC member

## **Programme**

1. Opening and Introduction on the purpose and consequences of the assessment.  
Appointment of Head of Meta-Panel and Meta-Panel Members.  
Prof. Šajgalík
2. Slovak Academy of Sciences in the 21th century  
The role of SAS in the country's research ecosystem.  
Dr. Majková
3. Structure of SAS including details of all three Sections.  
Dr. Omastová
4. The evaluation documents
  - a) Structure of the Questionnaire
  - b) Panel Member/ External Remote Expert Assessment Report document
  - c) The Final Assessment Report
  - d) The Terms of Reference of the Meta-Panel
  - e) The Terms of Reference of the Evaluation Panels and the External Remote Experts  
prof. Makarow, Dr. Omastová
5. Composition of the Evaluation Panels for Sections I-III.  
Prof. Omling, Prof. Maimets, Prof. Zic Fuchs
6. Timeline of the assessment  
Dr. Omastová
7. Conflict of interest and confidentiality
8. Communication strategy and logistics
9. Any other business
10. Concluding Remarks  
Prof. Šajgalík

## **Course of the session:**

### **1. Opening and Introduction on the purpose and consequences of the assessment. Appointment of Head of Meta-Panel and Meta-Panel Members.**

Prof. Šajgalík welcomed the participants to the first Meta-Panel meeting for the SAS assessment process, expressed his thanks the Panel members for accepting their positions and handed over the appointment letters. Prof. Šajgalík introduced the SAS vice-presidents and the SAS Accreditation Committee (AC) members.

Prof. Šajgalík emphasized the ambition of the SAS to play an important role in the European Research Area and the aim of assessment to identify the SAS top Institutes. SAS expects to find extra financial funds for the best institutes as the consequence of the assessment results.

### **2. Slovak Academy of Sciences in the 21th century**

The role of SAS in the country's research ecosystem.

Dr. Majková

*Details – see the presentation- attachment no.1 to MOM*

#### **Discussed topics:**

- info about post-doc scholarship SAS programme - SASPRO
- number of employees at the SAS institutes
- recent fusions of some SAS institutes
- structure of the SAS institutes
- collaboration between the SAS, Sections I, II., and III
- collaboration between the SAS and the Slovak industry
- collaboration between the SAS and the Slovak universities
- Slovak grant agencies
- ESFRI projects and the Slovakia ESFRI roadmap
- collaboration between the Visegrad Group countries / Slovakia, Czech Republic, Hungary, and Poland (V4)
- strategy of the Slovak science policy, strategy of the SAS - SAS 2020 (Attachment no. 5)
- Meta-Panel members asked to add to the presentation information about the Slovak Universities, relationship between SAS and Universities, and a description of the Slovak Founding Agencies (APVV, VEGA, and Research agency- agency for EU structural funds)

### **3. Structure of SAS including details of all three Sections.**

Dr. Omastová

*Details – see the presentation- attachment no.2 to MOM*

### **4. The evaluation documents**

*Details – see the attachment no.4 to MOM*

Principles for regular evaluation of SAS research institutes for period 2012 – 2015 (attachment no. 8.)

Terms of reference for Panel Chair, Panel members and External Remote expert- *attachment no.10 - 12 to MOM*

Panel Member/ External Remote Expert assessment report of SAS research institute, (Attachment no. 9.)

**Discussed topics:**

- status of PhD students at the SAS Institutes, their further career after the PhD, number of foreign PhD students, general policy of PhD studies, ECTS credit system, fellowships, why students apply for the PhD studies at SAS Institutes, etc.
- Table of the SAS Institutes salary budgets – parameter should be easy to compare (att.4, Questionnaire, Tab.1.6)
- Questionnaire, part 2.2.1. *Table with citations per annum*. Citations in Web of Science Core Collection, in Scopus, and in other databases.
- clarification of the term “Centre of excellence” in Slovak environment
- Table of research outputs (att. 4, **Questionnaire** Tab. 2.4.1 data in column :year 2012 cover projects started in and before 2012, data in columns 2013, 2014, 2015 cover projects started only in 2013, 2014, 2015)
- importance of internationalisation of PhD students
- information about number of PhD students and post-docs from abroad
- sectorial mobility, transfer of skills
- impact on society – difficulty to measure outputs directed for the social use
- gender issue at the SAS institutes
- accessibility of private sector collaboration possibilities with the SAS
- nature of previous SAS assessments
- ERC grants in Slovakia state, how to encourage application for the ERC grants, possibility to organise coaching, mentoring also in collaboration with V4 countries,
- need of harmonization of A,B,C,D ranking marks given by the Panels for all three Section
- structure of the Evaluation Panel, each Panel member shall be rapporteur for assigned SAS institutes
- deadline for finalising the final Panel report. Each Panel will finish their final report on the last day of site visit. Final report will be forwarded to the Meta-Panel members by AC Chair, M. Omastova.

**5. Composition of the Evaluation Panels for Sections I-III.**

Prof. Omeling, Prof. Maimets, Prof. Zic Fuchs

Panel Chairs introduced shortly their Panel members and discussed possible External Remote Experts for certain Institutes.

Remarks:

Panel 1 was completed on July 18, 2016.

For Panel III, the SAS Institutes will announce the need of External Remote Experts by 26 July 2016. Panel Chair, prof. Zic Fuchs, will be informed on decide for inviting experts accordingly. She can ask also Meta-Panel members for suggestion of External Remote Expert names for specific Institutes.

**6. Timeline of the assessment**

Dr. Omastová

Discussion on the time schedule.

**Discussed topics:**

- Structure of the site visits as suggested by the Head of the Meta-Panel: Institute director's introduction max. 20 minutes, questions and answers 30 minutes. Discussion with institute research staff. Interview of PhD students in closed session. Visit of one laboratory in some Institutes only for max 30 min.

**7. Conflict of interest and confidentiality****Discussed topics:**

- All the documents relevant for the evaluation shall be accessible on the SAS website by 15 August 2016
- Report from Meta-Panel shall be without the names of External Remote Experts

- assessment Panels reports to be submitted to the SAS representatives at the end of the site visit
- the SAS presidium will decide the way of publishing/presenting the Panels Reports and the assessment results
- in the case of questions from institutes, the SAS presidium shall answer, not the Meta-Panel
- the final reports should be submitted for the factual check to the SAS Institutes after Meta-Panel final meeting

## 8. Communication strategy and logistics

- logistics of site visits of Meta-Panel members

### Discussed topics:

- The Head of the Panel suggests only important unique infrastructure of the SAS Institutes to be presented to Panels members during site visits, the SAS suggested 1 laboratory per institute, max. 30 min. when relevant

### Remark:

- Earth Institute of the SAS (Section I) – due to recent fusion of the Geological Institute and Institute of Geophysics the reports were sent to the Panel by each institute separately, except the part 3 The future prospect. Site visit organisation suggestion by SAS: meeting 1<sup>st</sup> director, meeting 2<sup>nd</sup> director, then collective discussion.

The same procedure will be applied to merged Institutes in other two SAS Sections.

List of merged Institutes:

### Section I

- Geological Institute
- Geophysical Institute

merged on July 1, 2015 to the **Earth Science Institute**

Webpage: <http://www.geo.sav.sk>

### Section II

- Cancer Research Institute
- Institute for Clinical and Translational Research
- Institute of Experimental Endocrinology
- Institute of Virology

merged on January 1, 2016 to the **Biomedical Research Center**

Webpage: <http://www.bmc.sav.sk>

### Section III

- Institute for Forecasting
- Institute of Social Sciences
- The Institute of Experimental Psychology

merged on October 1, 2015 to the **Centre of Social and Psychological Sciences**

Webpage: <http://www.cspv.sav.sk>

- Final Meta-Panel meeting : January 20,2017, Smolenice castle, Slovakia

## 9. Any other business

### Discussed topics:

- Remuneration of external evaluators, final decision SAS Presidium
- All Panel members / Meta-Panel have to sign Mandate contract

- Reimbursing of Panel members expenses for travel to airport and back incurred during the Panel meetings

## 10. Concluding Remarks

President of SAS prof. Pavol Šajgalík thanked all the participants for their participation and cooperation.

### Summary of resolutions:

#### 1. information /documents to be submitted to the Meta-Panel members :

- information describing the trends of Slovak society and economy (E. Majková, E. Visnovsky) more details att. no. 3. Research and innovation ecosystem SR
- more detailed information on Slovak grant agencies - their competitiveness, (att no. 6 and 7)
- information on collaboration of the SAS with Slovak Universities
- SAS roadmap / document SAS 2020 Att. no 5.
- information on ESFRI process in Slovakia (K. Marhold)
- to add the clarification "Centre of Excellence" meaning into the presentation att.no.1
- preparation of a Guide / Manual to understand Questionnaire for evaluators - External Remote Expert and Panel member (M. Omastova)
- Meta-Panel members recommended to add into Questionnaire for all institutes a more detailed explanation of "social impact ( att no. 4./ Questionnaire, part 2.6 )
- Meta-Panel members also recommended to include into the Questionnaire *art 2.8.3. Important research infrastructure more detailed* description of new equipments used for topics and projects lead by Institute, the cooperation increase within SAS and SAS-Universities when new infrastructure was built up, relevance of obtained results, etc.
- information on gender issue in the SAS
- the link of the SAS website for all Panel members will send in August 2016 once the final data from the institutes will be inserted on the SAS website
- to add in the evaluation document ,att.4, Panel Member/ External Remote Expert assessment report of SAS research institute /the comment of panel members : strengths and weaknesses for each institute
- to send to Panel Members /Meta-Panel members the time table of site visits sorted according the week days
- all documents needed by the Panel members shall be available on the SAS website (to inform institutes to insert the Questionnaires on the SAS web page together with Annex 1: Institute publications in years 2012-2015, Annex 2: Institute Citations and reviews in years 2011-2014)
- each Panel will have the administrative support from SAS for writing of minutes of meeting during the site visits / panel meetings
- Dr. Omastova will be the contact person ready to answer any technical questions from the Panel members and External Remote Experts
- To inform institutes to provide during the side visits the information on PhD studies and their careers,
- Vision of SAS to 2030 (this document is not ready, it will be prepared in 2017 when new Presidium of SAS will elected)

Deadline: ASAP

Responsible: SAS headquarters

## 2. Information to be submitted by the Panel members

- Panel I announced need of External Remote Experts for the Astronomical Institute, Mathematical Institute, Institute of Construction and Architecture. Institute's directors from section I will announce need of External Remote Experts before August 3. AC Chair will send information to Panel Chair, prof. Omling. He will submit External Remote Experts before end of August.

Deadline: August 31, 2016

Responsible: prof. Omling

- to submit the list of External Remote Experts for the following institutes in Panel II: Institute of Inorganic Chemistry, Polymer Institute, Institute of Heart Research and Institute of Neuroimmunology

Deadline: August 31, 2016

Responsible: prof. Maimets

- after 26 July 2016, when AC Chair announced the need of External Remote Experts for Section III, Panel Chair, prof. Zic Fuchs, will start with inviting experts accordingly. She will submit the list of External Remote Experts to AC Chair before end of August.

Deadline: August 31, 2016

Responsible: prof. Zic Fuchs

- to send via snail mail 3 originals of Mandatory contract signed by blue pen to the following address: Dr. Mária Omastová, Slovak Academy of Sciences, Štefánikova 49, 814 38 Bratislava I., Slovak Republic.

Deadline: September/October 2016

Responsible:

Meta-Panel members, all Panel members, External Remote Experts

Recorded by: Eva Krištofová / SAS

Verified by: Dr. Mária Omastová / SAS

Approved by:

.....

Prof. Pavol Šajgalík

President of the SAS

In Bratislava on July 18, 2016

### Attachments:

Attachment no. 1. SAS 2016 Presentation of Dr. Eva Majková, vice-president of the SAS

Attachment no. 2. Presentation of Dr. Mária Omastová

Attachment no. 3. Research and innovation ecosystem SR (E. Majková)

Attachment no. 4. Questionnaire. Summary of the main activities of a research institute of the Slovak Academy of Sciences. *Period: January 1, 2012 - December 31, 2015*

Attachment no. 5. SAS 2020: The Long-Term Development Plan of the Slovak Academy of Sciences

Attachment no. 6. Annual Report of Slovak Academy of Sciences 2015

Attachment no. 7. SRDA Agency info

Attachment no. 8. Principles for regular evaluation of SAS research institutes for period 2012 – 2015

Attachment no. 9. Panel Member/ External Remote Expert assessment report of SAS research institute,

Attachment no. 10. -12. Terms of reference, 3 types

Attachment no. 13. ESFRI projects and the Slovakia ESFRI roadmap (will be prepared in August).