

# EXISTENCE OF CONTINUOUS UTILITY FUNCTIONS FOR ARBITRARY BINARY RELATIONS: SOME SUFFICIENT CONDITIONS

GIANNI BOSI — ALESSANDRO CATERINO — RITA CEPPITELLI

**ABSTRACT.** We present new sufficient conditions for the existence of a continuous utility function for an arbitrary binary relation on a topological space. Such conditions are basically obtained by using both the concept of a weakly continuous binary relation on a topological space and the concept of a network weight. We are concerning with suitable topological notions which generalize the concept of compactness and do not imply second countability or local compactness.

## 1. Introduction

The problem concerning the existence of a continuous utility function for a not necessarily *total preorder* on a topological space was extensively treated in the literature concerning the applications of mathematics to economics and social sciences.

P e l e g [33] was the first who provided sufficient conditions for the existence of a continuous utility function for a partial order on a topological space. Peleg said that he was solving a problem raised by A u m a n n [1], who pointed out that it is realistic not to assume that an individual may compare any two objects according to its own preferences, so that “incomparability” may take place in some cases (see also O k [31]).

Following the illuminating approach of N a c h b i n [30], who combined the classical results of mathematical utility theory with some of the most important achievements in elementary topology, Mehta was able to establish very general conditions for the existence of a continuous utility function for a not necessarily total preorder on a topological space (see, e.g., M e h t a [27] and the survey in M e h t a [28]). The reader may also consult the book by B r i d g e s and

---

2010 Mathematics Subject Classification: Primary 91B16; Secondary 54F05.  
Keywords: hereditarily Lindelöf space, weakly continuous binary relation, countable network weight, hemicompactness, submetrizability.

Meh t a [6] for a miscellanea of theorems concerning the existence of continuous order isomorphisms.

Herden [20] found a characterization of the existence of a continuous utility function for a not necessarily total preorder on a topological space by using the concept of a separable system. Herden also showed that the classical utility representation theorems of Eilenberg-Debreu and Debreu (see Debreu [14], [15] and Eilenberg [16]) concerning the existence of a continuous utility function for a continuous total preorder on a connected and separable topological space and respectively on a second countable topological space are corollaries of his main result. By using similar arguments, Bosi and Meh t a [5] presented a unified approach to the existence of a semicontinuous or continuous utility function on a preordered topological space, while the continuous utility representation problem in arbitrary concrete categories was discussed by Bosi and Herden [4].

In a slightly different context, Chateauneuf [13] characterized in a very elegant way the representability of a preference relation with pseudotransitive preference-indifference on a connected topological space by means of a pair of continuous real-valued functions.

In order to possibly generalize the theorems of Eilenberg-Debreu and Debreu to the case of a non-total preorder, Herden and Pallack [23] introduced the concept of a *weakly continuous* preorder  $\preceq$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$ .

We recall that a preorder  $\preceq$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is said to be weakly continuous if for every  $x, y \in X$  such that  $x \prec y$  there exists a continuous increasing function  $u_{xy} : (X, \tau, \preceq) \rightarrow (\mathbb{R}, \tau_{nat}, \leq)$  such that  $u_{xy}(x) < u_{xy}(y)$ .

Herden and Pallack showed that Debreu theorem is generalizable to the case of a weakly continuous preorder while Eilenberg-Debreu theorem is not. Furthermore, looking at the proof of Theorem 2.15 in Herden and Pallack [23], it is easily seen that there exists a continuous utility function for any weakly continuous preorder  $\preceq$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  such that the product topology  $\tau \times \tau$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf.

In this paper, we first generalize the aforementioned result presented by Herden and Pallack by showing that the existence of a continuous utility function for a binary relation  $R$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is equivalent to the existence of a topology  $\tau'$  coarser than  $\tau$  such that  $R$  is weakly continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  and  $(X, \tau')$  has a *countable network weight* (or equivalently, the product topology  $\tau' \times \tau'$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf). Then we use this result in order to derive some sufficient conditions for the existence of a continuous utility function. In this way, we generalize Debreu continuous utility representation theorem by showing that every weakly continuous binary relation on a topological space with a countable net weight has a continuous utility representation. This may be viewed as a generalization of a result in Caterino, Ceppitelli and

Meh t a [12], where the authors consider the case of a continuous total preorder on a topological space with a countable net weight. We recall that the concept of netweight has been used by C a m p i ó n, C a n d e a l, I n d u r á i n [7] in order to obtain some interesting representation results.

Finally, we show that suitable notions which generalize the concept of compactness such as  $\sigma$ -compactness, *hemcompactness*, and the concept of  $k$ -space (see, e.g., M c C o y [26]) may be invoked in order to guarantee the continuous representability of a weakly continuous binary relation on a submetrizable topological space (i.e., on a space that admits a coarser metrizable topology). It is remarkable that these situations do not imply second countability or local compactness (see L e v i n [24] and B a c k [2]). An interesting survey on hemi-compact  $k$ -spaces (the so-called  $k_\omega$ -spaces) can be found in [19]. Submetrizable  $k_\omega$ -spaces are studied in [10], [9]. We recall that submetrizable  $k_\omega$ -spaces are exactly the inductive limits of increasing sequences of metric compact subspaces [9]. Spaces of this kind are considered in [8] where some representation theorems for preorders are established. On the other hand, assumptions of this kind are interesting in economics since they are very frequently applied to function spaces (for example, the *compact-open topology* on the space of all continuous functions is considered in O k [32] in connection with the problem of representing continuous multifunctions).

## 2. Notation and preliminaries

Throughout this paper, we shall denote by  $R$  a binary relation on an arbitrary nonempty set  $X$ . The *strict part*  $R_S$  of  $R$  and the *symmetric part*  $I$  of  $R$  are defined as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} xR_Sy &\Leftrightarrow (xRy) \wedge \neg(yRx) & (x, y \in X), \\ xIy &\Leftrightarrow (xRy) \wedge (yRx) & (x, y \in X). \end{aligned}$$

Further, we shall denote by  $\mathcal{R}_S$  and  $\mathcal{R}'_S$  the *graphs* of  $R_S$  and the *dual* of  $R_S$ , namely

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{R}_S &= \{(x, y) \in X \times X : xR_Sy\}, \\ \mathcal{R}'_S &= \{(x, y) \in X \times X : (y, x) \in R_S\}. \end{aligned}$$

A *preorder*  $R$  on  $X$  is a *reflexive* and *transitive* binary relation on  $X$ . A pre-order is said to be *total* if for any two elements  $x, y \in X$  either  $xRy$  or  $yRx$ . In the sequel, a preorder will be preferably denoted by the symbol  $\preceq$ . In this case, the strict part of a preorder  $\preceq$  will be indicated by  $\prec$ .

The pair  $(X, R)$  will be referred to as a *related set* in the general case. If, in addition,  $\tau$  is a topology on the set  $X$ , then the triplet  $(X, \tau, R)$  will be referred to as a *topological related space*.

If  $(X, R)$  is a related set, then a subset  $A$  of  $X$  is said to be *decreasing* if, for every  $x \in X$  and  $y \in A$ ,  $xRy$  implies that  $x \in A$ .

Given a related set  $(X, R)$ , a real-valued function  $u$  on  $X$  is said to be

- (i) *increasing* if  $u(x) \leq u(y)$  for all  $x, y \in X$  such that  $xRy$ ,
- (ii) *order-preserving* if it is increasing and  $u(x) < u(y)$  for all  $x, y \in X$  such that  $xR_Sy$ .

In the sequel, an order-preserving function will be referred to as a *utility function*.

If  $\preceq$  is a total preorder on a set  $X$ , then the associated *order topology* will be denoted by  $\tau_{\preceq}$ . We recall that  $\tau_{\preceq}$  is the topology generated by the sets

$$L(x) = \{z \in X : z \prec x\} \quad \text{and} \quad U(x) = \{z \in X : x \prec z\}$$

with  $x \in X$ . A topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is said to be a *linearly ordered space* if  $\tau$  is the associated order topology with respect to a total order on  $X$ .

From Herden and Pallack [23], a binary relation  $R$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is said to be *weakly continuous* if, for all  $x, y \in X$  such that  $xR_Sy$ , there exists a continuous increasing real-valued function  $u_{xy}$  on  $(X, \tau, R)$  such that  $u_{xy}(x) < u_{xy}(y)$ .

Herden and Pallack [23, Lemma 2.2] proved that if  $R$  is a total pre-order, then the above defined weakly continuity of  $R$  on  $(X, \tau)$  coincides with the classical requirement that

$$L(x) = \{z \in X : zR_Sx\} \quad \text{and} \quad U(x) = \{z \in X : xR_Sz\}$$

are open subsets of  $X$  for every  $x \in X$ . In this case, the total preorder  $R$  on  $(X, \tau)$  is said to be *continuous*.

We recall that a preorder  $\preceq$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is said to be *closed* if  $\preceq$  is a closed subset of  $X \times X$  with respect to the product topology  $\tau \times \tau$  on  $X \times X$ . Herden and Pallack [23, Proposition 2.11] proved that every weakly continuous binary relation  $R$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  has a *weakly continuous refinement* by a closed preorder (i.e., for every weakly continuous binary relation  $R$  on  $(X, \tau)$  there exists a weakly continuous preorder  $\preceq$  on  $(X, \tau)$  such that  $R \subset \preceq$  and  $R_S \subset \prec$ ).

We recall that a topology  $\tau$  on a set  $X$  is a *hereditarily Lindelöf topology* if, for every subset  $A$  of  $X$  and every open covering  $\mathcal{C}$  of  $A$ , there exists some countable subcovering  $\mathcal{C}' \subset \mathcal{C}$  of  $A$ .

Let us recall some classical definitions in the theory of cardinal functions. As usual, the symbol  $\aleph_0$  will stand for the smallest infinite cardinal.

## EXISTENCE OF CONTINUOUS UTILITY FUNCTIONS

A family  $\mathcal{N}$  of subsets of a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is called a *network* for  $X$  if every non empty open subset of  $X$  is a union of elements of  $\mathcal{N}$ .

The *network weight* (or *net weight*) of  $(X, \tau)$  is defined by

$$nw(X, \tau) = \min\{|\mathcal{N}| : \mathcal{N} \text{ is a network for } (X, \tau)\} + \aleph_0.$$

As usual, define by

$$w(X, \tau) = \min\{|\mathcal{B}| : \mathcal{B} \text{ is a base for } (X, \tau)\} + \aleph_0$$

the *weight* of  $(X, \tau)$ . We recall that if  $(X, \tau)$  is either metrizable or locally compact or else linearly ordered then  $nw(X, \tau) = w(X, \tau)$  (see Engelking [17]).

For what concerns subspaces and topological products, we have that if  $(Y, \tau')$  is a subspace of  $(X, \tau)$  then

$$nw(Y, \tau') \leq nw(X, \tau)$$

and

$$nw\left(\prod_{s \in S} X_s, \prod_{s \in S} \tau_s\right) = \max\left\{|S|, \sup_{s \in S} nw(X_s, \tau_s)\right\}.$$

So, every subspace of a countable product of spaces having a countable net weight has a countable net weight. Since  $nw(X, \tau) = \aleph_0$  implies that  $(X, \tau)$  is Lindelöf, a countable product of spaces with a countable net weight is hereditarily Lindelöf.

### 3. Existence of continuous utilities

Herden and Pallack [23, Theorem 2.15] proved that every weakly continuous binary relation on a second countable space has a continuous utility representation. This result generalizes the famous Debreu utility representation theorem which states that every continuous total preorder on a second countable topological space admits a continuous utility representation (see Debreu [14], [15]). The following theorem characterizes the existence of a continuous utility function for an arbitrary binary relation on a topological space and therefore generalizes the aforementioned result proved by Herden and Pallack.

**THEOREM 3.1.** *Let  $R$  be a binary relation on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$ . Then the following conditions are equivalent:*

- (i) *There exists a continuous utility function  $u$  on  $(X, \tau, R)$ ;*
- (ii) *There exists a topology  $\tau'$  on  $X$  coarser than  $\tau$  such that  $R$  is weakly continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  and  $(X, \tau')$  is second countable;*
- (iii) *There exists a topology  $\tau'$  on  $X$  coarser than  $\tau$  such that  $R$  is weakly continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  and  $(X, \tau')$  has a countable net weight;*

- (iv) *There exists a topology  $\tau'$  on  $X$  coarser than  $\tau$  such that  $R$  is weakly continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  and the product topology  $\tau' \times \tau'$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf;*
- (v) *There exists a topology  $\tau'$  on  $X$  coarser than  $\tau$  such that  $R$  is weakly continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  and the topology  $(\tau' \times \tau')_{\mathcal{R}_S}$  induced by the product topology  $\tau' \times \tau'$  on the graph  $\mathcal{R}_S$  of  $R_S$  is Lindelöf.*

**P r o o f.** (i)  $\Rightarrow$  (ii). Let  $u$  be a continuous utility function on  $(X, \tau, R)$ . Consider the total preorder  $\preceq$  on  $X$  defined by

$$x \preceq y \Leftrightarrow u(x) \leq u(y) \quad (x, y \in X),$$

and let  $\tau' = \tau_{\preceq}$  be the order topology associated to  $\preceq$ . Observe that from the Debreu Open Gap Lemma (see, e.g., B r i d g e s and M e h t a [6, Lemma 3.13]), since there exists a utility function  $u$  on the totally preordered set  $(X, \preceq)$ , there also exists a continuous utility function  $u'$  on the totally preordered topological space  $(X, \tau', \preceq)$ . Since  $\preceq$  is (continuously) representable, we have that  $\tau'$  is second countable (see B r i d g e s and M e h t a [6, Proposition 1.6.11]). It is clear that  $\tau'$  is coarser than  $\tau$  from the definition of the total preorder  $\preceq$  and the continuity of the function  $u$  on the topological space  $(X, \tau)$ . Further, we have that  $R$  is weakly continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  since  $u'$  is continuous on  $(X, \tau')$  and we have that, for all  $x, y \in X$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} xRy &\Rightarrow u(x) \leq u(y) \Rightarrow x \preceq y \Rightarrow u'(x) \leq u'(y), \\ xR_Sy &\Rightarrow u(x) < u(y) \Rightarrow x < y \Rightarrow u'(x) < u'(y). \end{aligned}$$

(ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (iii). Trivial.

(iii)  $\Rightarrow$  (iv). See the considerations at the end of Section 2.

(iv)  $\Rightarrow$  (v). Immediate.

(v)  $\Rightarrow$  (i). Since the binary relation  $R$  on the topological space  $(X, \tau')$  is weakly continuous, we have that for every pair  $(x, y) \in X \times X$  such that  $xR_Sy$  there exists a continuous increasing function  $u_{xy}$  on  $(X, \tau', R)$  such that  $u_{xy}(x) < u_{xy}(y)$ . It is not restrictive to assume that  $u_{xy}$  takes values in  $[0, 1]$ . Define for every pair  $(x, y) \in X \times X$  such that  $xR_Sy$

$$\begin{aligned} A_{u_{xy}}(x) &:= u_{xy}^{-1} \left( \left[ 0, \frac{u_{xy}(x) + u_{xy}(y)}{2} \right] \right), \\ B_{u_{xy}}(y) &:= u_{xy}^{-1} \left( \left[ \frac{u_{xy}(x) + u_{xy}(y)}{2}, 1 \right] \right). \end{aligned}$$

Then the family

$$C := \{A_{u_{xy}(x)} \times B_{u_{xy}(y)}\}_{(x,y) \in \mathcal{R}_S}$$

is an open cover of the graph  $\mathcal{R}_S$  of  $R_S$ . Since the topology  $(\tau' \times \tau')_{\mathcal{R}_S}$  induced by the product topology  $\tau' \times \tau'$  on  $\mathcal{R}_S$  is Lindelöf, there exists a countable

## EXISTENCE OF CONTINUOUS UTILITY FUNCTIONS

subfamily  $C'$  of  $C$  which also covers  $\mathcal{R}_S$ , and therefore there exists a countable family  $\{u_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  of continuous increasing functions on  $(X, \tau', R)$  such that for every  $(x, y) \in X \times X$  with  $x R_S y$  there exists some  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $u_n(x) < u_n(y)$ . Hence,

$$u := \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} 2^{-n} u_n$$

is a continuous utility function on the topological related space  $(X, \tau', R)$ . Since  $\tau'$  is coarser than  $\tau$ , we have that  $u$  is also a continuous utility function on the topological related space  $(X, \tau, R)$  and the proof is complete.  $\square$

We recall that, from Herden [21], a topology  $\tau$  on a set  $X$  is said to be *useful* if every continuous total preorder  $\preceq$  on the topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is representable by a continuous utility function  $u : (X, \tau, \preceq) \longrightarrow (\mathbb{R}, \tau_{nat}, \leq)$ , where  $\tau_{nat}$  is the Euclidean topology on the reals (see also Herden and Pallack [22]). From Theorem 3.1, we immediately obtain the following corollary which provides a condition under which a topology is useful.

**COROLLARY 3.2.** *A topology  $\tau$  on a set  $X$  is useful provided that the product topology  $\tau \times \tau$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf (in particular, in case that  $\tau$  has a countable net weight).*

**Remark 3.3.** It is clear that Theorem 3.1 implies that whenever the product topology  $\tau \times \tau$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf then there exists a continuous utility function  $u$  for every weakly continuous binary relation  $R$  on  $(X, \tau)$  (see the considerations in the introduction). On the other hand, the condition that the product topology  $\tau \times \tau$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf is not necessary for the topology  $\tau$  to be useful. An example can be constructed in the following way. Consider a Tychonoff space  $Y$  (that is a completely regular Hausdorff space) such that  $Y \times Y$  is not Lindelöf, for instance the Sorgenfrey line. It is known that  $Y$  can be embedded into a Tychonoff cube  $X = [0, 1]^J$  and so,  $Y \times Y$  is homeomorphic to a subspace of  $X \times X$ . Hence,  $X \times X$  is not hereditarily Lindelöf. But, since  $X$  is compact, every continuous total preorder on  $X$  has a maximum and minimum. Therefore, applying Theorem 3 in Monteiro [29] to  $X$ , which is pathwise connected, we get that every continuous total preorder on  $X$  is representable by a continuous utility function.

We say that a topology  $\tau$  on a set  $X$  is *strongly useful* (see Bosi and Herden [3]) if every weakly continuous preorder  $\preceq$  on the topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is representable by a continuous utility function  $u : (X, \tau, \preceq) \longrightarrow (\mathbb{R}, \tau_{nat}, \leq)$ . It is clear that a strongly useful topology on a set  $X$  is also useful. Further, we say that a topology  $\tau$  on a set  $X$  is  *$R$ -strongly useful* if every weakly continuous binary relation  $R$  on the topological space  $(X, \tau)$  admits a continuous utility function  $u : (X, \tau, R) \longrightarrow (\mathbb{R}, \tau_{nat}, \leq)$ . Indeed, the two definitions are equivalent. In fact

we can state the following proposition whose proof is based on Proposition 2.11 in Herden and Pallack [23] (see the Introduction).

**PROPOSITION 3.4.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a topological space. The following conditions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $\tau$  is  $R$ -strongly useful;
- (ii)  $\tau$  is strongly useful;
- (iii) every closed and weakly continuous preorder  $\preceq$  on  $(X, \tau)$  admits a continuous utility function.

The following corollary of Theorem 3.1 provides a characterization of  $R$ -strongly useful topologies in the metrizable case. The proof is based on the theorem in Estévez and Hervés [18].

**COROLLARY 3.5.** *Let  $\tau$  be a metrizable topology on a set  $X$ . Then the following conditions are equivalent:*

- (i)  $\tau$  is  $R$ -strongly useful;
- (ii)  $\tau$  is useful;
- (iii)  $\tau$  is separable.

Denote by  $\Delta(X)$  the *diagonal* of a set  $X$  (i.e.,  $\Delta(X) = \{(x, x) : x \in X\}$ ). We recall that if  $(X, \tau)$  is a topological space, then a subset of  $X$  is said to be a  $G_\delta$ -set if it is a countable intersection of open subsets of  $X$ .

**COROLLARY 3.6.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a topological space and assume that  $R$  is a continuous total order. If the product topology  $\tau \times \tau$  on  $X \times X$  is Lindelöf and  $X$  has a  $G_\delta$ -diagonal, then  $R$  has a continuous utility representation.*

**Proof.** Since  $R$  is a total order then  $\{\Delta(X), \mathcal{R}_S, \mathcal{R}'_S\}$  is a partition of  $X \times X$ . Hence,  $\mathcal{R}_S \cup \mathcal{R}'_S = (X \times X) \setminus \Delta(X)$  is Lindelöf because it is a countable union of closed subsets of  $X \times X$ . Further, since  $R$  is a continuous linear order on  $(X, \tau)$ , we have that  $\mathcal{R}_S$  ( $\mathcal{R}'_S$ ) is open in  $X \times X$  since, for every  $(x, y) \in \mathcal{R}_S$  ( $(x, y) \in \mathcal{R}'_S$ ), there exists a continuous increasing function  $u_{xy}$  on  $(X, \tau, R)$  such that  $u_{xy}(x) < u_{xy}(y)$  ( $u_{xy}(x) > u_{xy}(y)$ ) and therefore, if we adopt the notation in the proof of Theorem 3.1, we have that  $A_{u_{xy}}(x) \times B_{u_{xy}}(y)$  is contained in  $\mathcal{R}_S$  ( $B_{u_{xy}}(x) \times A_{u_{xy}}(y)$  is contained in  $\mathcal{R}'_S$ ). In particular, we have that  $\mathcal{R}_S$  is a Lindelöf space when endowed with the induced topology  $(\tau \times \tau)_{\mathcal{R}_S}$ , and therefore, Theorem 3.1 is applied (see in particular the equivalence of the statements (i) and (v)).  $\square$

**COROLLARY 3.7.** *Let  $\preceq$  be a total preorder on a set  $X$ . Then  $\preceq$  has a utility representation if and only if the product topology  $\tau_{\preceq} \times \tau_{\preceq}$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf.*

## EXISTENCE OF CONTINUOUS UTILITY FUNCTIONS

**Proof.** If  $\preceq$  is a total preorder on a set  $X$  and there exists a utility representation for  $\preceq$ , then the order topology  $\tau_{\preceq}$  on  $X$  is second countable (see, e.g., Proposition 1.6.11 and Corollary 1.6.14 in Bridges and Mehta [6]) and therefore, it is clear that the product topology  $\tau_{\preceq} \times \tau_{\preceq}$  on  $X \times X$  is hereditarily Lindelöf. The converse is an immediate consequence of Theorem 3.1 (see in particular the equivalence of the statements (i) and (iv)) since it is clear that  $\preceq$  is (weakly) continuous on  $(X, \tau_{\preceq})$ .  $\square$

**Remark 3.8.** Using the proof of Corollary 3.7, we may immediately conclude that if  $(X, \preceq)$  is a totally preordered set, then the following equivalence holds:

$$\tau_{\preceq} \times \tau_{\preceq} \text{ is hereditarily Lindelöf} \Leftrightarrow \tau_{\preceq} \text{ is second countable.}$$

From Theorem 3.1 we can also immediately deduce the following proposition (see in particular the equivalence of the statements (i) and (iii)) which generalizes the classical Debreu continuous utility representation theorem. Compare also with Remark 4 in [12].

**PROPOSITION 3.9.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a topological space with  $nw(X, \tau) = \aleph_0$  and let  $R$  be a weakly continuous binary relation defined on  $(X, \tau)$ . Then  $R$  has a continuous utility representation.*

The following corollary is an immediate consequence of Proposition 3.9.

**COROLLARY 3.10.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a countable topological space and let  $R$  be a weakly continuous binary relation defined on  $(X, \tau)$ . Then  $R$  has a continuous utility representation.*  $\square$

**Remark 3.11.** We may observe that since there exist countable spaces which are not second countable, Corollary 3.10 is not a consequence of Theorem 2.15 in Herden and Pallack [23].  $\square$

In order to present further implications of Theorem 3.1, let us now recall some definitions. A topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is said to be *submetrizable* if there is a metric topology  $\tau'$  on  $X$  which is coarser than  $\tau$ . Moreover,  $(X, \tau)$  is *hemicompact* if there is a countable family  $\{K_n\}$  of compact subsets of  $X$  such that every compact subset of  $X$  is contained in some  $K_n$ . Of course, every hemicompact space is a countable union of compact sets, that is every hemicompact space is  $\sigma$ -compact. Finally,  $X$  is a *k-space* if a subset  $A \subset X$  is open if and only if  $A \cap K$  is open in  $K$  for every compact subset  $K$  of  $X$ .

Theorem 2.15 in Herden and Pallack [23] generalizes the well-known Levin's Theorem (see Levin [24]) which states that every closed preorder defined on a second countable locally compact topological space is representable by a continuous utility function. Caterino, Ceppitelli, Maccarino [11] extended Levin's Theorem to submetrizable hemicompact *k*-spaces. These spaces

are, in general, neither locally compact nor second countable. Therefore, Theorem 2.15 in Herden and Pallack [23] cannot be applied in this case.

**PROPOSITION 3.12.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a submetrizable,  $\sigma$ -compact space, and let  $R$  be a weakly continuous binary relation defined on  $(X, \tau)$ . Then  $R$  has a continuous utility representation.*

**Proof.** Since compact topologies are minimal among  $T_2$  topologies, every compact submetrizable space is metrizable, hence second countable. By  $\sigma$ -compactness, we have that  $X = \cup_n K_n$  with  $K_n$  compact, for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Let  $\mathcal{B}_n$  be a countable base for  $K_n$ . Then it is easily seen that  $\mathcal{N} = \cup_n \mathcal{B}_n$  is a countable network for  $(X, \tau)$ . Hence, the thesis follows from Proposition 3.9.  $\square$

**Remark 3.13.** We recall that every submetrizable  $\sigma$ -compact space is separable. The weaker assumptions of submetrizability and separability are not sufficient to guarantee the existence of a continuous utility representation for every continuous total preorder. As an example of this fact, consider the Sorgenfrey line  $(\mathbb{R}, \tau)$  (see Remark 3.3). Let  $\preceq$  be the preorder on  $\mathbb{R}$  defined by:

$$x \preceq y \Leftrightarrow \begin{cases} |x| > |y| \text{ or } (|x| = |y| \text{ and } x < 0) \text{ or } x = y & \forall x, y \in ]-1, 1], \\ \text{or} \\ x \in ]-\infty, -1] \cup ]1, +\infty[ \text{ and } y \in \mathbb{R}. \end{cases}$$

Then, it is not difficult to show that  $\preceq$  is a continuous total preorder on  $\mathbb{R}$ . Further,  $\preceq$  has uncountably many *jumps* (i.e., uncountably many pairs  $(x, y) \in \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}$  such that  $x \prec y$  and for no  $z \in \mathbb{R}$  it happens that  $x \prec z \prec y$ ). Indeed,  $(-a, a)$  is a jump for every  $0 < a < 1$ . Hence, we may conclude that  $\preceq$  cannot be representable by a (continuous) utility function. This preorder could be also constructed by means of a chain of open and closed subsets of  $\mathbb{R}$  (see Bosi and Herden [3]).

The following proposition generalizes Proposition 2.12 in Herden and Pallack [23], who showed that every closed preorder  $\preceq$  on a topological space  $(X, \tau)$  is weakly continuous provided that  $(X, \tau)$  is either a compact Hausdorff space or a locally compact second countable Hausdorff space. Indeed, if  $(X, \tau)$  is either a compact space or a locally compact second countable space then  $(X, \tau)$  is a hemicompact  $k$ -space.

**PROPOSITION 3.14.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a Hausdorff hemicompact  $k$ -space and let  $\preceq$  be a closed preorder on  $(X, \tau)$ . Then  $\preceq$  is weakly continuous.*

**Proof.** Assume that  $X = \cup_n K_n$  with  $K_n$  compact and  $K_n \subset K_{n+1}$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . Consider any two elements  $x, y \in X$  with  $x \prec y$ . Then, the set  $F = \{x, y\}$  is contained in  $K_{n_0}$  for some integer  $n$ . The function  $g: F \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  defined by  $g(x) = 0$ ,  $g(y) = 1$  can be extended to a continuous increasing function

## EXISTENCE OF CONTINUOUS UTILITY FUNCTIONS

$f_{n_0}: K_{n_0} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  (see from L e v i n [24, Lemma 2]). By using a recursive process, it is possible to construct a countable family  $\{f_n\}_{n \geq n_0}$ ,  $f_n: K_n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  of continuous increasing functions such that, for every  $n$ ,  $f_{n+1}$  is a continuous extensions of  $f_n$ . Since

$$X = \cup_n K_n \quad \text{and} \quad K_n \subset K_{n+1},$$

we have that there exists an increasing function  $f: X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  extending  $g$  which is continuous since  $X$  is a  $k$ -space.  $\square$

Finally, from Proposition 3.12 and from the above Proposition 3.14, we immediately obtain the following result which has already been proved by C a t e r i n o, C e p p i t e l l i and M a c c a r i n o [11, Theorem 3] by using a different technique.

**PROPOSITION 3.15.** *Let  $(X, \tau)$  be a submetrizable, hemicompact  $k$ -space and let  $\preceq$  be a closed preorder on  $(X, \tau)$ . Then  $\preceq$  has a continuous utility representation.*

## REFERENCES

- [1] AUMANN, R.: *Utility theory without the completeness axiom*, *Econometrica* **30** (1962), 445–462.
- [2] BACK, K.: *Concepts of similarity for utility functions*, *J. Math. Econom.* **15** (1986), 129–142.
- [3] BOSI, G.—HERDEN, G.: *The structure of completely useful and very useful topologies*, 2006 (preprint).
- [4] BOSI, G.—HERDEN, G.: *Continuous utility representations theorems in arbitrary concrete categories*, *Appl. Categ. Structures* **16** (2008), 629–651.
- [5] BOSI, G.—MEHTA, G. B.: *Existence of a semicontinuous or continuous utility function: a unified approach and an elementary proof*, *J. Math. Econom.* **38** (2002), 311–328.
- [6] BRIDGES, D. S.—MEHTA, G. B.: *Representations of Preference Orderings*, in: *Lecture Notes in Econom. and Math. Systems*, Vol. 422, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1995.
- [7] CAMPIÓN, M. J.—CANDEAL, J. C.—INDURÁIN, E.: *Semicontinuous order-representability of topological spaces*, *Bol. Soc. Mat. Mexicana* (3) **15** (2009), 81–90.
- [8] CANDEAL, J. C.—INDURAIN, E.—MEHTA, G. B.: *Some utility theorems on inductive limits of preordered topological spaces*, *Bul. Austral. Math. Soc.* **52** (1995), 235–246.
- [9] CASTAING, C.—RAYNAUD DE FITTE, P.—VALADIER, M.: *Young Measures on Topological Spaces. With Applications in Control Theory and Probability Theory*, in: *Math. Appl.*, Vol. 571, Kluwer Academic Publ. Dordrecht, 2004.
- [10] CASTAING, C.—RAYNAUD DE FITTE, P.—SALVADORI, A.: *Some variational convergence results with applications to evolution inclusions*, in: *Selected papers based on the presentation at the 3rd International Conference on Mathematical Analysis in Economic Theory* (Sh. Kusuoka et al., eds.), Tokyo, Japan, 2004, *Adv. Math. Econ.*, Vol. 8, Springer, Tokyo, 2006, pp. 33–73.

- [11] CATERINO, A.—CEPPITELLI, R.—MACCARINO, F.: *Continuous utility on hemicompact submetrizable  $k$ -spaces*, Appl. Gen. Topol. **10** (2009), 187–195.
- [12] CATERINO, A.—CEPPITELLI, R.—MEHTA, G. B.: *Representations of topological pre-ordered spaces*, Math. Slovaca, 2008 (to appear).
- [13] CHATEAUNEUF, A.: *Continuous representation of a preference relation on a connected topological space*, J. Math. Econom. **16** (1987), 139–146.
- [14] DEBREU, G.: *Representation of a preference ordering by a numerical function*, in: Decision Processes (R. Thrall, C. Coombs, R. Davies, eds.), Wiley, New York, 1954, pp. 159–166.
- [15] DEBREU, G.: *Continuity properties of a Paretian utility*, Internat. Econom. Rev. **5** (1964), 285–293.
- [16] EILENBERG, S.: *Ordered topological spaces*, Amer. J. Math. **63** (1941), 39–45.
- [17] ENGELKING, R.: *General Topology. Rev. and Compl. Ed.* . in: Sigma Ser. in Pure Math., Vol. 6, Heldermann Verlag, Berlin, 1989.
- [18] ESTÉVEZ TORANZO, M.—HERVÉS BELOSO, C.: *On the existence of continuous preference orderings without utility representations*, J. Math. Econom. **24** (1995), 305–309.
- [19] FRANKLIN, S. P.—SMITH THOMAS, B. V.: *A survey of  $k_\omega$ -spaces*, in: Proc. Topol. Conf., Baton Rouge, LA, 1977, Topology Proc., Vol. 2, Auburn Univ., Auburn, AL, 1978, pp. 111–124.
- [20] HERDEN, G.: *On the existence of utility functions*, Math. Soc. Sci. **17** (1989), 297–313.
- [21] HERDEN, G.: *Topological spaces for which every continuous total preorder can be represented by a continuous utility function*, Math. Soc. Sci. **22** (1991), 123–136.
- [22] HERDEN, G.—PALLACK, A.: *Useful topologies and separable systems*, Appl. Gen. Topol. **1** (2000), 61–82.
- [23] HERDEN, G.—PALLACK, A.: *On the continuous analogue of the Szpilrajn Theorem I*, Math. Soc. Sci. **43** (2002), 115–134.
- [24] LEVIN, V. L.: *A continuous utility theorem for closed preorders on a  $\sigma$ -compact metrizable space*, Soviet Math. Dokl. **28** (1983), 715–718.
- [25] LUTZER, D. J.—BENNET, H. R.: *Separability, the countable chain condition and the Lindelöf property on linearly ordered spaces*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **23** (1969), 664–667.
- [26] MCCOY, R. A.: *Functions spaces which are  $k$ -spaces*, in: The Proceedings of the 1980 Topology Conference (J. Dydak et al., eds.), Topology Proc., Vol. 5, Auburn Univ., Auburn, AL, USA, 1980, pp. 139–146.
- [27] MEHTA, G. B.: *Some general theorems on the existence of order-preserving functions*, Math. Soc. Sci. **15** (1988), 135–143.
- [28] MEHTA, G. B.: *Preference and Utility*. in: Handbook of Utility Theory, Vol. 1 (S. Barberá et al., eds.), Kluwer Academic Publ., Dordrecht, 1988, pp. 1–47.
- [29] MONTEIRO, P. K.: *Some results on the existence of utility functions on path connected spaces*, J. Math. Econom. **16** (1987), 147–156.
- [30] NACHBIN, L.: *Topology and Order*. Van Nostrand, Princeton, 1965.
- [31] OK, E. A.: *Utility representation of an incomplete preference relation*, J. Econom. Theory **104** (2002), 429–449.

## EXISTENCE OF CONTINUOUS UTILITY FUNCTIONS

- [32] OK, E. A.: *Functional representation of rotund-valued proper multifunctions*, New York University, 2002 (preprint).
- [33] PELEG, B.: *Utility functions for partially ordered topological spaces*, *Econometrica* **38** (1970), 93–96.
- [34] STEEN, L. A.—SEEBACH, J. A.: *Counterexamples in Topology*. Dover Publ., New York, 1995.

Received October 12, 2009

*Gianni Bosi*  
*Dipartimento di Matematica Applicata*  
*“Bruno de Finetti”,*  
*Università di Trieste*  
*Piazzale Europa 1*  
*I-34127 Trieste*  
*ITALY*  
*E-mail: giannibo@econ.units.it*

*Alessandro Caterino*  
*Rita Ceppitelli*  
*Dipartimento di Matematica*  
*ed Informatica*  
*Università di Perugia*  
*Via Vanvitelli 1*  
*I-06123 Perugia*  
*ITALY*  
*E-mail: caterino@dipmat.unipg.it*  
*matagria@dipmat.unipg.it*